Book review
Pięta, H., Maia, R. B., & Torres-Simón, E. (2023). *Indirect translation explained.* Routledge. ISBN: 978-1-003-03522-0

Saeed Ameri
University of Birjand, Iran
s.ameri@birjand.ac.ir

Mohammad Reza Rezaeian Delouei
University of Birjand, Iran
mrrezaeiand@birjand.ac.ir

Although largely ignored by earlier researchers or examined only to a limited extent, indirect translation—translation from or for a translation—has come to be recognized as a noteworthy area, which can open a wide field for researchers. It would be fair to assert that it has experienced a significant upswing in research attention in the past few years with the publication of three special issues in the journal *Target* (Pięta et al., 2022), *Translation Studies* (Rosa et al., 2017), *Perspectives* (Davier et al., 2023) and also encyclopedic entries and books (Andre, 2020; Hadley, 2023; Pięta, 2021) and numerous research articles. Despite all efforts so far, "research on indirect translation [is] lagging so far behind other subfields that focus on adjacent phenomena (e.g. retranslation or self-translation […])" (Davier et al., 2023, p. 824). Therefore, the volume under review will considerably contribute to the extant literature. This book, co-authored by renowned scholars of indirect translation and in an accessible style, explores indirect translation across various domains, such as news translation, interpreting, and audiovisual translation, from both theoretical and practical perspectives. As such, it expands beyond the traditional focus on written and literary translation (Pięta et al., 2023). Packed with practical exercises, helpful tips, and effective solutions for learners, this volume is an essential read for translator trainers, trainees, scholars, and researchers of indirect translation. The book comprises seven core chapters, along with an introduction and a conclusion. Each chapter presents learning outcomes and suggests thought-provoking activities, which aim to enhance reader engagement with the text. The book also contains a glossary, which defines key terms for readers.

The introductory chapter offers a comprehensive review of the central tenets of indirect translation through multiple perspectives. This is achieved by providing comprehensive typologies that outline where, why, and how indirect translation happens and who the main stakeholders are. Additionally, the authors examine indirect translation through the lens of practice, research and training to predict what lies ahead and outline potential developments. The authors also discuss terminological and conceptual confusion around indirect translation. It seems that

the practice dates back to the translation of the Bible; however, the practice, nowadays, covers all text types and genres. The chapter provides an overview of various factors that may lead to the use of indirect translation: lack of (competent) translators, unavailability of the original text, economic and temporal constraints, the prestige of the intermediary language, the risk-minimization strategies of the agents involved, and the simplicity of the process. The overarching conclusion drawn from this section is that indirect translation will become more relevant in the foreseeable future, and research in this area will likely become more interdisciplinary.

Chapter 2 touches on indirect translation in interpreting, otherwise known as relay interpreting. Relay interpreting is an uncharted territory, and this chapter offers a wealth of insights into this field and learning best practices. The authors initially chart the history of relay interpreting and then explore it in the contemporary era. Relay interpreting, as they put it, can be performed in a variety of settings (crises, business, legal, etc.) and in simultaneous, consecutive and sight interpreting modes. Given the real-time mode of interpreting, the authors identify two core constraints: spatial immediacy and temporal immediacy. The former refers to the situation where all the participants in the interpreting process, from the pivot to the audience, share a single location, while the latter stresses the need for the interpreting to be produced in real-time or with a very small-time lag. The two constraints lead to some challenges, undermining the interpreting accuracy. For example, non-verbal cues of the original speaker are simply lost in relay interpreting due to temporal delays or the pivot's inability to convey them to the pivot effectively. The situation becomes exacerbated in consecutive interpreting where the time lag is significantly higher. The other challenge relates to the relay-taker's potential lack of familiarity with the cultural nuances of the original speaker, which may lead to communication issues if rendered inaccurately. The chapter then turns to offering recommendations for effectively dealing with various challenges of relay interpreting. These suggestions include providing the second interpreter (relay taker) with the original speaker's slides and relevant details and keeping them in sync with the visual aids. The authors mention that "obvious candidates for omission are the speaker's slips of the tongue or false starts [and] there is often no need to render them, nor is it always necessary to faithfully replicate the speaker's digressions" (p. 35). This may be less feasible during well-structured speeches; however, the pivot can rely on condensation techniques in the field of subtitling, such as changing the word class or point of view, to provide a more succinct rendition of the speech when necessary. Although the authors provide a list of valuable tips for pivots and relay-takers to keep up with a fast-paced speech, we think, when feasible, the speaker should be requested to be mindful of their speaking pace, particularly in the context of simultaneous interpreting since "the added complexity resulting from the doubling of an already complex process makes relay doubly prone to errors or losses of message integrity" (Čeňková, 2015, p. 340).

Chapter 3 on scientific and technical translation specifically focuses on translating patents, instructional texts, and popular science where indirect translation might be practiced. The authors discuss the mediating role of English as a lingua franca in this regard and the use of machine translation. Considering the process of patenting, indirect translation helps inventors and evaluators check the originality of the patent against patents in other languages and countries. However, the use of machine translation may cause terminological and conceptual errors. The authors then move on to discuss technical writing. As technical documentation may

be written for non-native English speakers and future translations, and technical writers, sometimes in cooperation with engineers, write for further translators and not end-users, they need to write in a readable, comprehensible, translation-friendly manner, considering the needs of various target audiences. Furthermore, second translators use indirect translation as a starting point for their translation, so if the pivot text is confusing and ambiguous, chances are that the second TT will lack usability. Given that indirect translation is predominantly performed into English, the variety of English employed should be culturally neutral; clarity, conciseness, coherence, accuracy, consistency, and directness are essential linguistic features to facilitate the comprehension of the mediating text by the second translator, who does not use the translation for his or her own purposes, but to serve the needs of subsequent users. These suggestions may come in handy not only for indirect translation but also for every kind of academic writing. Regarding popularizing science, indirect translation contributes to the dissemination of scientific texts among lay audiences. What is interesting in the chapter is the section that examines the function of indirect translation in Wikipedia and crisis management, such as during the Covid-19 pandemic. The Chapter concludes with thought-provoking questions for discussion such as similarities and differences between technical writing, multilingual writing, and indirect translation.

Chapter 4 focuses on localization of websites, video games, and software programs originally developed in languages other than English. First, as localization requires multilingual and multi-professional teams (engineers, software developers, programmers, product designers, market analysts, project managers, language specialists) who may not share the working languages involved, a third language that everyone understands might be used. Second, as simultaneous localization in different locales/internationalization is a desired outcome for the development team, indirect translation professionals should be consulted at the pre-translation stage to predict, address, and overcome the possible challenges that may arise in future translations. The chapter then focuses on three phases of localization. The pre-translation/pre-localization phase is a crucial step in the localization process, as it allows for identifying and addressing potential challenges. During this phase, the market is analyzed and potential mediating or target languages are identified. This information is then used to develop a localization strategy that will ensure the success of the project. Sometimes, the production of a culturally neutral or flexible version, using controlled language, is encouraged to generate a translation-friendly source text that is ready to go beyond the mediating language and become internationalized. In the translation/localization phase, translated elements and the degree of localization are identified. The original version might undergo constant changes, even after the localization has started, which necessitates changes in the mediating translation and the final translation. The last phase, named post-translation/post-localization, focuses on quality control. Experts in indirect translation could be involved in assessing the viability and suitability of indirect translation, developing methods for multilingual content creation, selecting the intermediary language(s), and applying machine translation. The main shortcoming of this chapter is its primary focus on localization itself, not the relation between indirect translation and localization or the application of the former in the latter.

Chapter 5 examines indirect translation in literary translation. The main focus of the chapter on the ethics of relay translation has left no room for techniques and strategies for doing literary relay translation, as covered in other chapters. The authors initially mention the Anglo-American market, wherein the domestication of foreign literature is considered customary. Nonetheless, the sources confirming this

assertion primarily date back to the 1990s, so there is a need for fresh evidence to make reasonable conclusions about the Anglo-American translation market. The other sections delve into a detailed discussion of ethical issues and considerations related to indirect translation. The authors analyze how different guidelines for translation, such as UNESCO 1976 and ATLF 2013, have addressed the ethical dimension of indirect translation, and their survey shows that only two documents have briefly addressed the ethical challenges of doing indirect translation. The authors subsequently present the legal challenges of the practice, including copyright ownership, compensation, and infringement of relay rights. What is missing in the chapter is a list of real-life challenges of literary relay translation and effective solutions. In addition, the hyperlinks offered on page 123 could be shortened to enhance their accessibility for readers.

Chapter 6 explores indirect translation in the realm of audiovisual translation (AVT) in general and subtitling in particular. Having traced the development of indirect translation in AVT, the authors shift their focus to pivot templates in professional subtitling. This is followed by examining the definition and process of indirect translation in subtitling, as well as its potential advantages and disadvantages within the subtitling industry. The authors proceed to discuss the main challenges of pivot templates in professional subtitling, which range from linguistic differences between languages (e.g., differences in lexicon, grammar, or level of formality) and subtitling peculiar techniques (condensation and omission due to spatial and temporal limitations of subtitling) to errors introduced by the first translator and mismatches between the original audio and the subtitling template. Valuable guidance and insights on crafting a fit-for-purpose pivot template are subsequently presented. The chapter concludes with recommendations for effectively translating from a pivot template, such as leveraging technology to transcribe the original audio or consulting with fellow translators and shareholders. Although the authors believe that SDH subtitles cannot be used for templates, now some subtitling software applications can remove SDH features. For instance, *Subtitle Edit* includes a "Remove Text for Hearing Impaired" option in its Tools menu. The authors discuss automatic transcription software on page 151; specific subtitling software programs now have this option as a built-in feature (e.g., *Subtitle Edit)*. In the warm-up activity, it would be wise to provide the Portuguese transcript of the sense as this would allow students/learners to compare the original Portuguese with the English template, and further practice subtitling it to a third language such as Persian.

Chapter 7 centers on written news translation, exploring the development of indirect news translation from its origins in the early modern period and how news dissemination and consumption became globalized in the mid-nineteenth century. The complexity and intricacy of translation processes in news production and dissemination, particularly considering the emergence of satellite television and social media, become the point of discussion in the next section. In fact, news translation involves the synthesis of multiple source texts into a single target text and news agencies typically rely on various sources of information, such as other agencies, wire services, and social media, to compile the news. Consequently, the translator should craft a coherent text, which is faithful to the original content while also being tailored to the target audience. When it comes to the challenges, creating a quick, simple and short piece of news, otherwise known as "translator-friendly news dispatch" is a priority, and translation of quotations demands an accurate and faithful translation. Other challenges are the potential for ideological manipulation stemming from recontextualization strategies.

Chapter 8 looks at the influence of indirect translation on workflow and the application of project management (PM) in different modes and types of indirect translation discussed in previous chapters. The primary responsibility of project managers is to determine the feasibility and suitability of indirect translation for each project. They also supervise the coordination of various tasks when multiple source texts and languages are involved, and translators collaborate through a common intermediary language, or when existing translations are used as the basis for further translations. The tasks they usually undertake or monitor include budget allocation, time management, negotiation with translators and clients, quality control and quality assurance, cooperation between all parties, and the application of technology. Project managers play a crucial role in indirect translation projects, as they can assign tasks to translators who have proficiency in the source language and can thus enhance the quality of the final product. The chapter then explores how project management is applied to the translation types discussed in the previous chapters. For example, it highlights the importance of PM in both conference interpreting and consecutive interpreting, where relay interpreting is a must, as it facilitates effective task allocation and execution. It is also an essential element for scientific-technical translation as files can be easily prepared and organized. When it comes to indirect literary translation, PM helps coordinate large-scale projects and address the ethical issues discussed in the fifth chapter. The chapter concludes with some questions for further discussion and contextualized activities which offer hands-on practice in the field.

The final chapter briefly provides a critical evaluation of the book, including its strengths, a synthesis of each chapter's main points, and an explanation of why some other topics were not addressed in the present volume or why the book adopted a Europe-centered perspective (based on the authors' expertise). The authors mention that although indirect translation, as an intrinsically cooperative task, is present everywhere, it has been historically associated with pejorative connotations and is still invisible in terms of theory. Therefore, it needs scholarly attention, and the inclusion of indirect translation in the university curriculum helps trainees, as would-be translators, acquire indirect translation skills necessary for the translation job market. Overall, indirect translation, as the authors argue, can contribute to social justice and cultural diversity by not only translating from central languages but also translating for peripheral languages, reducing inequalities, facilitating equal access to information, fostering sustainable development, and empowering peripheral languages.

Overall, this rich volume provides a comprehensive snapshot of indirect translation across the discipline of translation studies. It presents various challenges that arise from the practice of indirect translation, proposes practical solutions and discusses the most recent developments and trends. It also presents the previous research and current theories on this topic. The book will be an invaluable resource for both students and scholars. Nonetheless, this indispensable resource still has potential for further improvement. In certain chapters, the authors do not explicitly address indirect translation, particularly in the chapters pertaining to literary translation and localization. As a result, the connection between these topics is occasionally overlooked. Given that a book cannot encompass everything, future research avenues should be directed towards indirect translation of children's literature, video games, religious texts, and new media (YouTube). Future research should focus on analyzing the job market and identifying the specific competencies outlined in job advertisements concerning indirect translation. Additionally, the field of translation studies should explore the impact of indirect translation on

translation revision, a topic of current interest. Lastly, investigating the role of indirect translation in empowering peripheral languages presents promising research opportunities.

References

Andre, J. S. (2020). Relay. In M. Baker & G. Saldanha (Eds.), *Routledge encyclopedia of translation studies* (pp. 470-473). Routledge.

Čeňková, I. (2015). Relay interpreting. In F. Pöchhacker (Ed.), *Routledge encyclopedia of interpreting studies* (pp. 339-341). Routledge.

Davier, L., Marin-Lacarta, M., Pöchhacker, F., Gambier, Y., Ivaska, L., & Pięta, H. (2023). Studying indirect translation: A conversation with and between L. Davier, M. Marin-Lacarta and F. Pöchhacker. *Perspectives*, *31*(5), 822-838. https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2023.2221389

Hadley, J. L. (2023). *Systematically analysing indirect translations*. Routledge.

Pięta, H. (2021). Indirect translation. In Y. Gambier & L. v. Doorslaer (Eds.), *Handbook of translation studies* (pp. 113-119). John Benjamins.

Pięta, H., Ivaska, L., & Gambier, Y. (2022). What can research on indirect translation do for Translation Studies? *Target. International Journal of Translation Studies*, *34*(3), 349-369. https://doi.org/10.1075/target.00012.pie

Pięta, H., Ivaska, L., & Gambier, Y. (2023). Structured literature review of published research on indirect translation (2017–2022). *Perspectives*, *31*(5), 839-857. https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2023.2221379

Rosa, A. A., Pięta, H., & Bueno Maia, R. (2017). Theoretical, methodological and terminological issues regarding indirect translation: An overview. *Translation Studies*, *10*(2), 113-132. https://doi.org/10.1080/14781700.2017.1285247